

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

600 CHIEF JUSTICE CUSHING WAY SCITUATE, MASSACHUSETTS 02066 (781) 545-8716



Decision of the Scituate Zoning Board of Appeals on the application of Melissa and Jamie Davenport, 16 Booth Hill Road, Scituate, MA 02066 (hereinafter, the "Applicant") for a Special Permit/Finding pursuant to M.G.L. Chapter 40A, Section 6, and Scituate Zoning Bylaw (the "Bylaw") Sections 810.2 that the reconstruction/extension/alteration of an existing nonconforming single family residential structure on a nonconforming lot, and the proposed structure, although greater than 20% larger, will not be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing nonconforming structure or lot.

The application was received, advertised and a public hearing was duly held on April 18, 2013, with the following members of the Zoning Board of Appeals hearing the application:

Peter Morin, Chairman Edward C. Tibbetts John Hallin

The subject property (the "Subject Property") at 16 Booth Hill Road is owned by Jamie D. Davenport and Melissa Davenport as Tenants by the Entirety, by way of a deed recorded with the Plymouth County Registry of Deeds in Book 37463 Page 136-138. It is located in Residence A-2 Zoning District, and is not located within the Water Resources Protection District. The Subject Property is 34,750 ± SF with 90± foot frontage on Booth Hill Road. The Applicant has provided a copy of the current tax assessment from the Town of Scituate which indicates that the single family dwelling on the Subject Property was constructed in 1955. Whereas the use of the lot is residential and the lot predates the adoption of the dimensional requirements of the zoning by law in 1956, the dwelling is a pre-existing nonconforming structure. The pre-existing nonconformities of the Subject Property are:

- (a) Lot Frontage = 90 feet (100 feet required)
- (b) Lot Width =  $90\pm$  feet (125 feet required)
- (c) Southerly Side Yard Setback = 3 feet (15 feet required)

The Applicant proposes to alter the existing single family dwelling on the Subject Property by adding a 1,050± sq. ft., two-story, addition that will increase existing living area (1,836± sq ft.) by more than 20%; approximately 57%.

No one in attendance at the Public Hearing spoke in opposition to the proposal.

M.G.L. Ch. 40A Section 6 provides that "pre-existing nonconforming structures and uses may be extended or altered, provided, that no such extension or alteration be permitted unless there is a finding by the permit granting authority or by the special permit granting authority designated by ordinance or by-law that such change, extension or alteration shall not be substantially more detrimental than the existing nonconforming [structure or] use to the neighborhood."

The Board specifically FINDS that the existing single family dwelling is a pre-existing nonconforming structure/use entitled to the protection afforded in M.G.L. Ch. 40A Section 6.

In addressing whether the proposed use of the new structure will be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing nonconforming use or structure, the Board considers the guidelines set forth in <u>Powers v. Building Inspector of Barnstable</u>, 363 Mass. 648 (1973), <u>Derby Refining Company v. City of Chelsea</u>, 407 Mass. 703 (1990), and <u>Building Commissioner of Medford v. McGrath</u>, 312 Mass. 461 (1942).

Based on the information presented, the Board FINDS that the proposed alteration and use will not be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing nonconforming structure and use, and that the proposed structure or use will not be substantially different in character or substantially more detrimental or injurious to persons, property, or improvements in the vicinity. The Board reviewed the following documents provided by the Applicant:

1. Plot Plan for Addition, #16 Booth Hill Road, Scituate, MA, by Grady Consulting, L.L.C., 71 Evergreen Street, Suite 1, Kingston, MA 02364, Dated March 20, 2013

In addition, the Board FINDS that, prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall provide:

- 1. A revised Plot Plan which includes the detail of Lot Width as defined by the Town of Scituate Zoning Bylaws
- 2. A Plan which details the existing and proposed Gross Floor Area

This Special Permit and these findings are issued pursuant to Zoning Bylaw Sections 810.2 and G.L. Ch. 40A, Section 6.

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

Vun

Peter Morin, Chairman

Edward C. Tibbetts

John Hallin

Filed with Town Clerk on April 22, 2013.

This Special Permit will not become effective until such time as an attested copy of this decision has been filed with the Plymouth County Registry of Deeds after the appeal period of twenty (20) days.

Appeal of any decision of the Zoning Board of Appeals may be made pursuant to M.G.L. Chapter 40A, Section 17, and shall be filed in a court of competent jurisdiction. Proof of that filing shall be provided to the Town Clerk within twenty (20) days of the date of the filing of the decision with the Town Clerk.