

Public Building Commission, May 23, 2013

TOWN OF SCITUATE MASSACHUSETTS

PUBLIC BUILDING COMMISSION

Scituate Library

Meeting Minutes of Thursday, May 23, 2013

Committee Members Present:

Edward DiSalvio

Jacqueline Carr

Tony D'Onofrio

Michael Hager

Carl Campagna

Also present:

Kevin Kelly, Town Facilities Manager

1. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER Meeting called to order at 7:00 pm by Chairperson Ed DiSalvio.

2. ACCEPTANCE OF AGENDA The agenda was unanimously accepted.

3. INTERVIEW OF POTENTIAL OPM FOR PUBLIC SAFETY COMPLEX

•Arcadis: Richard Sitnik and Rachel Stratford. Their company has experience with these types of projects and other municipal projects, including schools. With each project they manage the schedule and budget as well as the design aspect. Mr. Sitnik stated that Arcadis has developed a process that is very successful in managing the project timeline. For example, to hold an architect accountable, Arcadis puts deliverables into the request for services. Arcadis will put together the criteria of deliverables for the architect and make their review of the architect based on how they met the deadlines. This has been effective in past projects.

In Phase 1 of the Scituate Public Safety Complex project, Arcadis would help ensure the budget is appropriate as well as agreeable to the townspeople. Also, they would help the town retain an architect that is knowledgeable in Public Safety facilities. In Phase 2, they will utilize other measures to manage the project. Mr. Sitnik referred to a handout.

Rachel Stratford was the project manager for the new Ware fire station. That project came in a week early and under budget. She looked at that budget daily and tracked invoices and payments in order to be able to present an overall view to the owner at any time. Also, she kept a PCO log of any changes that could have incurred a cost as the project moved forward. There had been a lot of change orders and they were able to help the town identify what they needed vs. what they wanted. They were also able to work with the contractors to get credits and then use those to do other things.

Mr. Sitnik stated that they also have a protocol to working with contractors. They try to pre-qualify contractors in order to help avoid future problems. When onsite, Ms. Stratford manages contractors, monitors quality, and deals with any issues as they arise. She has experience working in dispute resolution and is sensitive to avoiding disputes when possible. Finally, Mr. Sitnik said that Arcadis always has "quality, cost and schedule, plus communication" in mind.

Jacqueline Carr asked them to clarify what they meant by communication, especially with the town. Ms. Stratford answered that during the Ware project she had monthly updates with the Building Commission before construction began. After construction began, she held weekly progress meetings. Mr. Sitnik stated that on average their interaction with clients/owners is every two weeks.

Carl Campagna asked who would be the project manager? Rachel Stratford. He also asked, what are the deficiencies they referred to in the handouts? Mr. Sitnik answered that they could be certain things that are due to the drawings. Mr. Campagna asked for clarification on how they follow the project cost thru each phase as it evolves. Mr. Sitnik answered that they require the architect to do their own estimate and ensure that they are on the same page to avoid misunderstanding. Arcadis will manage scope creep. To this, Mr. Campagna asked how close have they been to their estimates? Mr. Sitnik answered, very close, although, last summer they had a project where bids came in much higher than expected. This was due to the fact that it was a tornado hit school in Springfield and the market was inflated.

Tony D'Onofrio asked about the flow chart provided. Mr. Sitnik answered that value engineering and other specialists are employed, but that estimating would be done in house. Mr. D'Onofrio also asked about the litigation history provided. Mr. Sitnik said that they submitted it because he is often asked to. In the last five years, none of his projects have been involved in any litigation.

•CDR Maguire: Tony DiLuzio and Kevin __. Mr. DiLuzio used the Montague Police and Fire Project as one example of their company's experience. He gave a handout to the members of the PBC and described the process they went through there. Montague uses geothermal and electrical power so it is unique regarding environmental issues/concerns. They also worked on the Dennis Police Station, which was in a Historic District. CDR Maguire has worked for the Town of Yarmouth under tight budget constraints and with a lot of options to consider. Mr. DiLuzio stated that they are very accustomed to working with towns. They have a lot of different experiences and have been doing project management long before required by law. He stated that they like to see the architect and the OPM on the same page and working together. They strive to be a Project Manager who can build a successful team.

Tony D'Onofrio asked if the approach given on the handout is what they were proposing for Scituate? Mr. DiLuzio said it was where they would start. Mr. D'Onofrio also asked what they saw as the role of the PBC? Mr. DiLuzio said that the PBC would direct CDR Maguire and that CDR Maguire would be there to meet the day-to-day needs of the PBC. Tony D'Onofrio pointed out that the programming was not done, and the site not chosen. He asked what their comments were on that? Mr. DiLuzio agreed that the request was not as detailed as one would normally see. However, CDR Maguire would help Scituate look at all the questions and also sell the project to the townspeople.

Carl Campagna asked CDR Maguire to elaborate on where they would start with budget estimates. Tony DiLuzio said that CDR Maguire would jump right in. They can start from a square footage to get a ballpark cost based on other projects that most resemble Scituate's in size and scope.

Jacqueline Carr asked how CDR Maguire has worked with the PBC in other towns. Kevin __ said they start working with committee's very early in the process. They are happy to take on anything the group would like them to. They will be at any/all meetings with the PBC as an expert. They see themselves as the right hand of the committee to carry their mission forward. They can even work with the town accountant and touch every invoice if that is what the town wants/needs.

Carl Campagna wanted to know if meeting two times per month was included in basic services? Yes, in fact they anticipate meeting even more if need be. Kevin __ agreed that if the town wants to meet once a week, they are part of the group and are vested in the project and will do that. Tony DiLuzio said that they believe the objective of the OPM is to help the town thru the entire process.

Tony D'Onofrio asked how they would aid in the selection of the architect? Mr. DiLuzio answered that they would work with the town to do the RFQ. Also, they would work with the town in the interim to select a site and decide what the town needs/wants. Also, CDR Maguire would get a feel from the town what they will want from their architect. Because CDR Maguire has experience working with many of the architects in the area they will be able to give samples of the architect's previous work as well.

•Daedalus: Richard Marks, Shane Nolan and Joe Sullivan. Daedalus does project management and cost estimating. They have worked on a number of Police and Fire facilities including Whitman, Franklin, Munson

and Medfield.

Shane Nolan would be the Project Manager for Scituate. He has a Bachelors Degree in Construction Management and has done 25 public projects under the current regulations. He will manage the project from programming, schematic design, all the way thru to construction.

Joe Sullivan would be the onsite representative. He went to Northeastern for accounting. Mr. Sullivan is currently working on the West Tisbury Police Station where they are adding a fire station. He would help Scituate: select the architect, decide on the scope, work on the schematic and final designs, and manage the bidding and construction phases. He has experience in this area after working on the Franklin Fire Station. Mr. Sullivan would deal with any design changes, quality control, project schedule and the budget. He would handle any changes/corrections as need be. He would also provide daily reports, coordinate inspections, etc. Mr. Sullivan would work closely with commissions and town departments.

Carl Campagna asked how Daedalus' past project estimates have compared to costs considering they have in house estimators? West Tisbury came in within 1% of their estimates. Whitman came in 3-4% below. These examples show that their bid results have been great. In house estimating is a great service that Daedalus provides. Mr. Sullivan reiterated that the estimates are constantly being revised and that they keep track of what the architect is doing to ensure that it is within the project scope. Mr. Campagna also asked if it was within basic services to meet as need be? Yes, Daedalus will come to meetings as needed as well as provide monthly reports. They will also make sure the architects are coming prepared for meetings.

Tony D'Onofrio asked what they felt the role of the PBC was? Mr. Nolan answered that they will work closely with the PBC to ensure they have answers to the concerns of the townspeople. Mr. Sullivan said they would work as an arm of the PBC. He offered that Daedalus could build a website as a way of getting the townspeople involved. Also, they can host Q&A sessions with the townspeople. Mr. D'Onofrio stated that the programming has not been done and the site is not confirmed. He asked what they thought of that? Mr. Nolan answered that first they can find out what the town needs, then see where it will fit. As far as programming is concerned, Daedalus can sit with the Fire and Police Chiefs and do that together. Everyone agreed that schematic design cannot be done without the site as even access and flow can be big issues. The upside is that it is good to have an expert on board while selecting the site. Mr. Sullivan said that they would get involved in the feasibility and testing of sites.

Joe Sullivan encouraged the PBC to call their references. Daedalus is proud of how well they communicate with towns, architects and contractors alike.

Carl Campagna asked how many of past change orders have been because of project design deficiencies? Richard Marks answered that they are normally below 1%. When needed Daedalus will perform an additional design review in order to avoid problems. Mr. Sullivan answered that often they have to control owner changes more than anything else. Mr. Marks added that they walk the Police and Fire Chiefs thru the drawings to help avoid changes and ensure that the town knows what they are getting. All of this is part of their basic service. Mr. Nolan has knowledge of what current Police and Fire standards are. Mr. Sullivan also has experience with these types of projects and can offer an expert opinion about what makes sense. All of this is done before going to bid to avoid change orders.

Mr. Marks stated that Daedalus could help the town go to bid on the project before getting approval from the townspeople at town meeting. This can be a good approach to use in a conservative town because the voters love to see a fixed number before passing a motion.

Carl Campagna asked if Daedalus would help write the RFQ for the architect? Yes. Daedalus would work closely with the PBC. They can even recommend the 'right' people to request within an architecture firm as well as encourage the best contractors to bid on the job. Mr. Campagna also asked about planning for future needs. Mr. Nolan said yes, they have the knowledge and experience to take all of these things into consideration.

Finally, Mr. Sullivan added that part of his job would be to submit a budget each month. He would track each expenditure and go over each invoice with the architect before submitting to the town.

- PMA Consultants: Steve Rusteika, Kevin Nigro and Ed Whelan. PMA Consultants is an OPM firm with many types of experience. They work closely with a cost-estimating firm in Hingham because of their expertise. PMA Consultants sees their role as providing leadership and to make sure goals, schedule and the budget is met. They will offer objective advice, make sure the owner knows what is going on with the project at all times and submit up to date reports. They have developed a system of reporting with forms etc. to help control the quality of their work. PMA Consultants see themselves as a partner on any project.

Ed Whelan said PMA would help Scituate find an appropriate site. They would also help the town find the right designer. He described how they would help maximize the town's efforts for getting approval at town meeting by giving out information ahead of time. Mr. Whelan also talked about how PMA would manage the project budget.

Kevin Nigro used a previous job as an example of the checks and balances that occur at every stage of the drawing review process. He emphasized that PMA will perform due diligence and hold all stake holders accountable. Mr. Nigro also showed the PBC a chart with items and ratings that PMA uses to help a town distinguish their wants vs. needs. Mr. Rusteika added that they believe in having interactive meetings where costs can be evaluated and decisions made together.

Mr. Whelan gave North Andover as an example of their Building Option Evaluation. This detailed the process of helping the town find what they needed. Mr. Nigro talked about the North Andover project and how they assisted with master planning as well as accounting for possible future projects. These examples are to demonstrate the process that PMA uses.

In Summary, Mr. Rusteika listed some relevant projects. He mentioned that PMA has extensive experience with school projects and funding projects at town meeting etc. PMA has won many awards in New England. They have verified success bringing projects in on time and under budget. They are a dedicated OPM firm and enjoy public sector work.

Carl Campagna asked how their cost estimates compared to the bids that came in on previous projects? Mr. Rusteika said 'pretty close'. PMA works very diligently and has the architect submit an estimate as well in order to check one vs. the other. Mr. Nigro added that you want the estimate to be as close as possible because if the bids are drastically under the town will not realize a value.

Jacqueline Carr asked why a Clerk of the Works was not listed. The answer was that they have Clerks that they use a lot but they did not include one because Scituate is still looking toward Phase 1. PMA has specific criteria for their Clerk of the Works. In a current Swampscott project Ed Whelan is the PM and the Clerk of the Works.

4. DISCUSSION BY PBC

Chairperson Ed DiSalvio invited members to give their rankings and any comments:

- Mike Hager: Daedalus, PMA, CDR Maguire.
- Carl Campagna: Daedalus, CDR Maguire, PMA.
- Ed DiSalvio: Daedalus, PMA, CDR Maguire.
- Jacqueline Carr: Daedalus, PMA, CDR Maguire.
- Tony D'Onofrio: Daedalus, CDR Maguire, Arcadis.

Town Facilities Manager Kevin Kelly gave his expert opinion but did not officially vote. (Daedalus/PMA, CDR Maguire)

Tony D'Onofrio argued that PMA did not stick to the format of the interview. He was also not impressed that

they do not have experts in house but rather pick and choose consultants. He pointed out that the other firms were able to say who would be working on our project.

Mike Hager stated that he liked the companies who emphasized that they would work to anticipate problems and avoid them.

Jacqueline Carr said that she liked the idea of having real time progress meetings.

Carl Campagna said that he liked how Daedalus and CDR Maguire had expert resources in house. He also mentioned that he had spoken with the Fire Chief in another town as a reference for Arcadis and was told that Scituate should be tough negotiating the fee structure b/c Arcadis was priced high at first but came down for this other town.

Chairperson Ed DiSalvio tallied the votes and submitted the ranking: 1st Daedalus, 2nd PMA, and 3rd CDR Maguire

Carl Campagna made the motion, Jacqueline Carr 2nd, the PBC voted unanimously to accept the above ranking.

5. MEETING ADJOURNED Motion to adjourn the meeting made by Ed DiSalvio, 2nd by Carl Campagna, the PBC voted unanimously to adjourn at 9:22pm.

Respectfully submitted,
Simone Zimmerman
Recording Secretary